

Proceedings of the Meeting of the Leeds City Council held Civic Hall, Leeds on Wednesday, 1st April, 2015

**PRESENT:** The Lord Mayor Councillor David Congreve in the Chair.

WARD

## ADEL & WHARFEDALE

Barry John Anderson John Leslie Carter

## ALWOODLEY

Peter Mervyn Harrand Neil Alan Buckley Dan Cohen

## **ARDSLEY & ROBIN HOOD**

Lisa Mulherin Karen Renshaw Jack Dunn

#### ARMLEY

Alice Smart Alison Natalie Kay Lowe James McKenna

## **BEESTON & HOLBECK**

David Congreve Angela Gabriel Adam Ogilvie

## **BRAMLEY & STANNINGLEY**

Kevin Ritchie Caroline Gruen Ted Hanley

## **BURMANTOFTS & RICHMOND HILL**

Ron Grahame Maureen Ingham Asghar Khan

# WARD

# **CALVERLEY & FARSLEY**

Rod Wood

Joseph William Marjoram

# CHAPEL ALLERTON

Eileen Taylor Mohammed Rafique Jane Dowson

# **CITY & HUNSLET**

Mohammed Iqbal Elizabeth Nash Patrick Davey

#### **CROSS GATES & WHINMOOR**

Peter John Gruen Debra Coupar Pauleen Grahame

# **FARNLEY & WORTLEY**

David Blackburn Ann Blackburn

## **GARFORTH & SWILLINGTON**

Stuart McKenna Andrea McKenna Mark Dobson

# **GIPTON & HAREHILLS**

Kamila Maqsood Roger Harington Arif Hussain

## **GUISELEY & RAWDON**

Pat Latty Graham Latty Paul John Spencer Wadsworth

#### HAREWOOD

Matthew Robinson Ann Castle Rachael Procter

#### HEADINGLEY

Jonathon Pryor Janette Walker Neil Walshaw

## HORSFORTH

Brian Cleasby Christopher Townsley Dawn Collins

## **HYDE PARK & WOODHOUSE**

Javaid Akhtar Christine Denise Towler Gerry Harper KILLINGBECK & SEACROFT

Brian Michael Selby Graham Hyde Veronica Morgan **KIPPAX & METHLEY** 

Keith Ivor Wakefield Mary Elizabeth Harland James Lewis

## **KIRKSTALL**

Fiona Venner Lucinda Joy Yeadon John Anthony Illingworth

#### **MIDDLETON PARK**

Kim Groves Paul Anthony Truswell Judith Blake

## MOORTOWN

Sharon Hamilton Alex Sobel Rebecca Charlwood

## MORLEY NORTH

Thomas Leadley Robert Finnigan Robert Gettings

## **MORLEY SOUTH**

Shirley Varley

Neil Dawson

# **OTLEY & YEADON**

Ryk Downes Sandy Edward Charles Lay Colin Campbell

#### PUDSEY

Mick Coulson Josephine Patricia Jarosz Richard Alwyn Lewis

#### ROTHWELL

Barry Stewart Golton David Nagle Karen Bruce **ROUNDHAY** 

Ghulam Hussain Bill Urry Christine Macniven **TEMPLE NEWSAM** 

Michael Lyons Judith Cummins Katherine Mitchell

#### WEETWOOD

Judith Mara Chapman Jonathan Bentley Susan Bentley

#### WETHERBY

John Michael Procter Gerald Wilkinson Alan James Lamb

## 103 Announcements

a) The Lord Mayor informed Council that the following Councillors would not be seeking re-election to Council, and said a few words in respect of each Councillor and thanked them for their work over the years on behalf of the Council:-

Councillor JL Carter Councillor Hanley Councillor Marjoram Councillor Mitchell Councillor Morgan

- b) The Lord Mayor informed Council that George Mudie MP, a former Leader of Leeds City Council would be retiring as Member of Parliament for East Leeds at this years elections.
- c) The Lord Mayor informed Council that Victor Watson CBE, DL had recently passed away.
- d) The Lord Mayor informed Council that Honorary Alderman Gardiner had recently passed away.

Council stood in silent tribute.

#### 104 Minutes

It was moved by Councillor Nash, seconded by Councillor G Latty and

**RESOLVED –** That the minutes of the meeting held on 25<sup>th</sup> February 2015 be approved.

#### **105** Declaration of Interest

There were no declarations of interest.

## 106 Communications

The Executive Member (Children and Families) informed Council of the outcome of the recent OFSTED inspection and comments on this matter were also received form representatives of each political group.

#### 107 Deputations

Two deputations were admitted to the meeting and addressed Council, as follows:-

- 1) Deputation regarding private sector housing and letting agencies.
- 2) Association of South Horsforth Residents regarding saving Leeds Green Belt.

**RESOLVED –** That the subject matter in respect of deputation 1 be referred to the Director of Environment & Neighbourhoods for consideration in consultation with the relevant Executive Member and that the subject matter in respect of deputations 2 be referred to the Director of City Development for consideration in consultation with the relevant Executive Member.

#### **108** Report on Outer North West Community Committee

It was moved by Councillor Wadsworth, seconded by Councillor G Latty and

**RESOLVED –** That the report on the work of the Outer North West Community Committee be noted.

#### **109** Report on Inner North East Community Committee

It was moved by Councillor Hamilton, seconded by Councillor Urry and

**RESOLVED –** That the report on the work of the Inner North East Community Committee be noted.

**110 Report on Outer South Community Committee** It was moved by Councillor Bruce, seconded by Councillor Nagle and

**RESOLVED –** That the report on the work of the Outer South Community Committee be noted.

#### 111 Questions

Q1 Councillor B Anderson to the Leader of Council

Does the Leader of Council agree with comments made by the Shadow Chancellor, Ed Balls, that cast doubt on the future of the second phase of HS2?

The Leader of Council replied.

Q2 Councillor Cleasby to the Executive Member (Neighbourhoods, Planning & Personnel).

Could the Executive Board member for Neighbourhoods, Planning & Personnel confirm what efforts have been made or are being made by Leeds City Council to ensure that the Leeds City College site, formerly known as Park Lane Horsforth Campus site, is retained for educational purposes?

The Executive Member (Neighbourhoods, Planning & Personnel) replied.

Q3 Councillor Hyde to the Executive Member (Cleaner, Stronger and Safer Communities).

Can the Executive Member please explain what lessons have been learnt from Operation Boypark?

The Executive Member (Cleaner, Stronger and Safer Communities) replied.

Q4 Councillor Finnigan to the Executive Member (Neighbourhoods, Planning and Personnel).

"Following the refusal of Planning Permission for his Cottingley Springs Expansion Plan could the Executive Board Member for Housing confirm if he agrees with the Planning Inspectors comments that the Councils rejection of alternative sites because of negative perception and fear of encroachment leads to relegating Traveller sites to isolated locations and to choosing greenfield and Green Belt sites before brownfield sites and does he also agree with her that this is in direct conflict with the Councils own planning policies?" The Executive Member (Neighbourhoods, Planning and Personnel)replied.

Q5 Councillor Taylor to the Executive Member (Transport and the Economy).

Please could the Executive Member let members have his views on the implications of the proposed changes to the Local Authorities (Functions and Responsibilities) Regulations?

The Executive Member (Transport and the Economy) replied.

Q6 Councillor Wadsworth to the Executive Member (Neighbourhoods, Planning & Personnel).

Can the Executive Member for Planning provide an assurance that any conditions attached to approval for further development of High Royds will be sufficiently robust so as to ensure that any and all obligations are met by developers in a timely fashion?

The Executive Member (Neighbourhoods, Planning & Personnel) replied.

Q7 Councillor S Bentley to the Leader of Council

Does the Leader of the Council agree with me that it is important that as many people as possible are registered to vote in the next General and Council elections?

The Leader of Council replied.

Q8 Councillor Illingworth to the Chair of the West Yorkshire Combined Authority's Transport Committee

Please would the Chair of the West Yorkshire Combined Authority's Transport Committee update council on work on the new station at Kirtskall Forge?

The Chair of the West Yorkshire Combined Authority's Transport Committee replied.

Q9 Councillor Ingham to the Executive Member (Neighbourhoods, Planning & Personnel).

Could the Executive Member with responsibility for planning please update Council on its recent planning appeal performance?

The Executive Member (Neighbourhoods, Planning & Personnel) replied.

Q10 Councillor J Procter to the Executive Member (Neighbourhoods, Planning & Personnel).

Will the Executive Board Member for Neighbourhoods, Planning and Personnel confirm to Council when he intends to initiate the public consultation on site allocations?

The Executive Member (Neighbourhoods, Planning & Personnel) replied.

At the conclusion of question time, the following questions remained unanswered and it was noted that, under the provisions of Council Procedure Rule 11.6, written answers would be sent to each Member of Council:-

- Q11 Councillor Lay to the Executive Member (Neighbourhoods, Planning & Personnel).
- Q12 Councillor Macniven to the Executive Member (Adult Social Care).
- Q13 Councillor Selby to the Executive Member (Digital & Creative Technologies, Culture and Skills).
- Q14 Councillor Lamb to the Executive Member (Health and Well-being).
- Q15 Councillor Lay to the Executive Member (Digital & Creative Technologies, Culture and Skills).
- Q16 Councillor Dawson to the Executive Member (Neighbourhoods, Planning & Personnel).
- Q17 Councillor Urry to the Executive Member (Health and Well-being).
- Q18 Councillor Flynn to the Executive Member (Children and Families).
- Q19 Councillor Robinson to the Executive Member (Transport and the Economy)
- Q20 Councillor Castle to the Executive Member (Cleaner, Stronger and Safer Communities)
- Q21 Councillor Robinson to the Leader of Council
- Q22 Councillor Robinson to the Executive Member (Transport and the Economy)

#### 112 Minutes

It was moved by Councillor Wakefield, seconded by Councillor Nash that the minutes be received in accordance with Council Procedure Rule 2.2(i).

**RESOLVED –** That the minutes be received in accordance with Council Procedure Rule 2.2(i)

Council Procedure Rule 4, providing for the winding up of business, was applied prior to all notified comments on the minutes having been debated.

## 113 Motion to Suspend Council Procedure Rule

During the debate under minute 112 above, it was moved by Councillor Nash, seconded by Councillor G Latty that under the provisions of Council Procedure Rule 22.1 that Council Procedure Rule 3.3 be suspended to allow consideration of the Executive Board minutes for an additional 10 minutes until 4.20pm, comments on the other minutes will then follow until 4.40pm with the Leader of Council commencing his summing up at 4.40pm for a period up to 10 minutes.

Upon being put to the vote, the motion was carried.

# 114 Back Bench Community Concerns

Council heard the following Community Concerns;

- 1) Councillor Gabriel The need for high quality planning enforcement and building control.
- 2) Councillor J McKenna Heritage Bid at 2 Branch Road, Armley.
- 3) Councillor Wilkinson Overnight parking of HGV's in and around Wetherby.
- 4) Councillor Townsley To raise issues regarding parking at Horsforth Rail Station
- 5) Councillor A Blackburn Parking on pavements and grass verges.

During consideration of Community Concerns, the meeting was suspended at 5.00pm and resumed at 5.25pm.

**115** White Paper Motion (in the name of Councillor A Carter) - Planning Matters In accordance with Council Procedure Rule 12.5(b) it was moved by Councillor J Procter, seconded by Councillor Lamb that following the most recent Office of National Statistics (ONS) household projections for Leeds, this Council believes that the case for reducing Leeds' 70,000 housing target is now even stronger.

This Council therefore instructs officers from the planning department to begin work on reviewing the proposed housing number for Leeds immediately.

This Council notes the recent success achieved by campaigners opposing the Kirklees Knoll planning application in Farsley. Council welcomes the Government's decision to refuse this application as a clear sign that Greenbelt or Greenfield locations should only be proposed when there are no other options available.

An amendment was moved by Councillor Leadley, seconded by Councillor Varley,

Delete all after 'Following' and replace with ;

publication of detailed returns from the 2011 Census in 2013, and after noting the most recent Office of National Statistics (ONS) household projections for Leeds, this Council believes that the case for reducing Leeds' LDF Core Strategy housing target of 74,000 new dwellings is now even stronger.

Therefore this Council instructs officers in the Planning department to review the housing numbers proposed in the Leeds LDF Core Strategy without delay.

This Council notes the recent successes achieved by campaigners opposing the Planning applications at Kirklees Knoll at Farsley, and at Cottingley Springs. Council welcomes the decisions to refuse these applications as clear signs that greenfield and Green Belt locations should be proposed only when no other options are available.

A second amendment was moved by Councillor P Gruen, seconded by Councillor Rafique,

Delete all after "household projections for Leeds" and replace with:

this Council -once again- affirms its commitment to continually monitor and respond to the available evidence regarding upcoming housing need and delivery.

This Council welcomes that this approach has secured recognition of the Council's 5 year land supply and the importance of having an adopted Core Strategy in the

Kirklees Knoll appeal. Council notes the upcoming appeals, where these advances will no doubt be important considerations.

Council calls on officers to move ahead with analysis of ONS household projections, in line with the ongoing Site Allocation proposals.

The amendment in the name of Councillor Leadley was declared lost.

The amendment in the name of Councillor P Gruen was carried and upon being put to the vote, it was

**RESOLVED -** That following the most recent Office of National Statistics (ONS) household projections for Leeds this Council -once again- affirms its commitment to continually monitor and respond to the available evidence regarding upcoming housing need and delivery.

This Council welcomes that this approach has secured recognition of the Council's 5 year land supply and the importance of having an adopted Core Strategy in the Kirklees Knoll appeal. Council notes the upcoming appeals, where these advances will no doubt be important considerations.

Council calls on officers to move ahead with analysis of ONS household projections, in line with the ongoing Site Allocation proposals.

On the requisition of Councillor G Latty and Lamb, the voting on the amendments were recorded as follows;

Amendment in the name of Councillor Leadley

<u>YES - 15</u>

J Bentley, S Bentley, A Blackburn, D Blackburn, Campbell, Cleasby, Chapman Downes, Finnigan, Gettings ,Golton, Lay , Leadley, Townsley and Varley.

#### <u>NO - 60</u>

Akhtar, Blake, Bruce, Charlwood, Coulson, Coupar, Cummins, Dawson, Dobson, Dunn, Gabriel, P Grahame, R Grahame, C Gruen, P Gruen, Groves, Hamilton, Hanley, Harington, Harland, Harper, A Hussain, G Hussain, G Hyde, Illingworth, Ingham, Iqbal, Jarosz, A Khan, J Lewis, R Lewis, Lowe, Lyons, Macniven, Maqsood, J McKenna, S McKenna, Mitchell, Morgan, Mulherin, Nagle, Nash, Ogilvie, Pryor, Rafique, Renshaw, Ritchie, Selby, Smart, Sobel, E Taylor, Towler, Truswell, Urry, Venner, Walker, Walshaw, Wakefield, Wilkinson and Yeadon.

#### ABSTAIN - 15

Anderson, Buckley, J L Carter, Castle, ,Cohen, Collins, Harrand, Lamb, G Latty, P Latty, J Procter, Robinson, Wadsworth , Wood and Wilkinson.

Amendment in the name of Councillor P Gruen

## <u>YES – 60</u>

Akhtar, Blake, Bruce, Charlwood, Coulson, Coupar, Cummins, Dawson, Dobson, Dunn, Gabriel, P Grahame, R Grahame, C Gruen, P Gruen, Groves, Hamilton, Hanley, Harington, Harland, Harper, A Hussain, G Hussain, G Hyde, Illingworth, Ingham, Iqbal, Jarosz, A Khan, J Lewis, R Lewis, Lowe, Lyons, Macniven, Maqsood, J McKenna, S McKenna, Mitchell, Morgan, Mulherin, Nagle, Nash, Ogilvie, Pryor, Rafique, Renshaw, Ritchie, Selby, Smart, Sobel, E Taylor, Towler, Truswell, Urry, Venner, Walker, Walshaw, Wakefield, Wilkinson and Yeadon.

## <u>NO - 10</u>

J Bentley, S Bentley, D Blackburn, Campbell, Cleasby, Chapman Downes, Golton, Lay and Townsley

#### ABSTAIN - 20

Anderson, A Blackburn, Buckley, J L Carter, Castle, ,Cohen, Collins, Finnigan, Gettings ,Harrand, Lamb, G Latty, P Latty, Leadley, J Procter, Robinson, Wadsworth , Wood , Varley and Wilkinson.

# 116 White Paper Motion (in the name of Councillor Blake) - Children and Young People

It was moved by Councillor Blake, seconded by Councillor Smart that this Council is proud to put children, young people and families at the heart of our growth strategy for the city.

Council commends the progress made for the most vulnerable children in Leeds through the child friendly city ambition, in spite of the damaging policies of the coalition Government and exceptionally challenging financial context. Progress evidenced by: a safe, appropriate reduction in the number of children and young people in care; a significant rise in young people in education employment and training; and our best ever school attendance figures.

Council recognises the unfair disproportionate burden young people have had to bear from the recent financial crisis.

Council calls on the next Government to make a genuine commitment to improving outcomes for all children and young people and put in place meaningful policies to address the poverty, debt, unemployment and mental health challenges that have blighted too many young people growing up in the UK over the past five years.

Council calls on the new Government to: invest properly in early intervention, further and higher education, training, employment and accessible transport for young people; demonstrate compassion for the pressures and problems of growing up in today's society; and devolve more freedom to local services so that those working directly with our young people have the powers and permissions they need to make a difference.

Council believes that these measures will start to undo the damage that has been caused over the past five years and ensure that future generations do not suffer from the same massive burden of failing Government austerity measures with regard to young people.

An amendment was moved by Councillor Lamb, seconded by Councillor S Bentley

In paragraph one delete 'growth strategy for the'

In paragraph two delete 'the damaging policies of the coalition government and' in the first sentence

Delete paragraph three and replace with new paragraphs to read:

'This Council recognises that Leeds has a long standing commitment to cross party working on established city priorities such as improving services offered to children and young people in the city. This has enabled a whole council approach to driving the improvements in this directorate in recent years.

'Council further recognises that over the last five years the Government has striven to invest in the future for young people, even in the difficult economic climate inherited from the Labour government. The last five years has seen the introduction of Pupil Premium; expansion of apprenticeships; free childcare; Free School Meals; the lowest numbers of young people NEET since 2010; the highest ever number of disadvantaged young people entering university and early intervention success with the Troubled Families programme.'

Delete paragraphs four, five and six, and replace with new paragraphs to read:

'This Council gives thanks to the hard working Council staff who are doing valuable and important work in often difficult circumstances.

'We call upon the next government to continue to ensure that our children and young people get the best start in life, receive a good education, and continue to receive the opportunities that they need to achieve the most out of their lives.'

#### Motion will Read:

'This Council is proud to put children, young people and families at the heart of our city.

'Council commends the progress made for the most vulnerable children in Leeds through the child friendly city ambition, in spite of the exceptionally challenging financial context. Progress evidenced by: a safe, appropriate reduction in the number of children and young people in care; a significant rise in young people in education employment and training; and our best ever school attendance figures.

'This Council recognises that Leeds has a long standing commitment to cross party working on established city priorities such as improving services offered to children and young people in the city. This has enabled a whole council approach to driving the improvements in this directorate in recent years.

'Council further recognises that over the last five years the Government has striven to invest in the future for young people, even in the difficult economic climate inherited from the Labour government. The last five years has seen the introduction of Pupil Premium; expansion of apprenticeships; free childcare; Free School Meals; the lowest numbers of young people NEET since 2010; the highest ever number of disadvantaged young people entering university and early intervention success with the Troubled Families programme.

'This Council gives thanks to the hard working Council staff who are doing valuable and important work in often difficult circumstances. 'We call upon the next government to continue to ensure that our children and young people get the best start in life, receive a good education, and continue to receive the opportunities that they need to achieve the most out of their lives.'

The amendment in the name of Councillor Lamb was declared lost and upon being put to the vote it was;

**RESOLVED** - That this Council is proud to put children, young people and families at the heart of our growth strategy for the city.

Council commends the progress made for the most vulnerable children in Leeds through the child friendly city ambition, in spite of the damaging policies of the coalition Government and exceptionally challenging financial context. Progress evidenced by: a safe, appropriate reduction in the number of children and young people in care; a significant rise in young people in education employment and training; and our best ever school attendance figures.

Council recognises the unfair disproportionate burden young people have had to bear from the recent financial crisis.

Council calls on the next Government to make a genuine commitment to improving outcomes for all children and young people and put in place meaningful policies to address the poverty, debt, unemployment and mental health challenges that have blighted too many young people growing up in the UK over the past five years.

Council calls on the new Government to: invest properly in early intervention, further and higher education, training, employment and accessible transport for young people; demonstrate compassion for the pressures and problems of growing up in today's society; and devolve more freedom to local services so that those working directly with our young people have the powers and permissions they need to make a difference.

Council believes that these measures will start to undo the damage that has been caused over the past five years and ensure that future generations do not suffer from the same massive burden of failing Government austerity measures with regard to young people.

**117** White Paper Motion (in the name of Councillor Lay) - Health Budget Devolution It was moved by Councillor Lay, seconded by Councillor J Bentley that this council believes that it is best able to both understand and set local health priorities and calls on government to devolve the health and social care funding to Leeds City Region.

An amendment was moved by Councillor Buckley, seconded by Councillor G Latty

Delete all after "This Council" and replace with the following:

"regrets that West Yorkshire's leaders have failed to achieve a devolution agreement on the same scale as what has been achieved in Manchester, where, among other powers, the region is due to receive significant health and social care funding.

"Council believes that decisions about health priorities should be taken locally and therefore calls on West Yorkshire's leaders to work with government in order to get the funding package and powers that the Leeds City Region deserves, including responsibility for health and social care funding.

"Council further believes that entrenched opposition to new regional governance models should not be the reason that people in Leeds and the wider region miss out on more powers and funding, and so urges West Yorkshire's leaders to consider all options on the table with a view to getting the best possible deal for local people."

A second amendment was moved by Councillor Mulherin, seconded by Councillor Coupar;

Add:

However, Council believes that any devolution of health powers should come with adequate funding to meet the growing financial pressures of and demand for the NHS and Social Care in the city region.

Council also believes that any devolution in relation to health funding should be accompanied by strong democratic accountability arrangements and not further bureaucratic layers.

Council believes that any new governance structures should be considered in a clear and transparent way. Council therefore calls on the next Government to create an independent commission to ensure delivery of the devolved powers in as timely a manner as possible."

Full Motion will the read:

"This council believes that it is best able to both understand and set local health priorities and calls on government to devolve the health and social care funding to Leeds City Region.

However, Council believes that any devolution of health powers should come with adequate funding to meet the growing financial pressures of and demand for the NHS and Social Care in the city region.

Council also believes that any devolution in relation to health funding should be accompanied by strong democratic accountability arrangements and not further bureaucratic layers.

Council believes that any new governance structures should be considered in a clear and transparent way. Council therefore calls on the next Government to create an independent commission to ensure delivery of the devolved powers in as timely a manner as possible."

The amendment in the name of Councillor Buckley was declared lost.

The amendment in the name of Councillor Mulherin was carried and upon being put to the vote, it was

**RESOLVED** - That this council believes that it is best able to both understand and set local health priorities and calls on government to devolve the health and social care funding to Leeds City Region.

However, Council believes that any devolution of health powers should come with adequate funding to meet the growing financial pressures of and demand for the NHS and Social Care in the city region.

Council also believes that any devolution in relation to health funding should be accompanied by strong democratic accountability arrangements and not further bureaucratic layers.

Council believes that any new governance structures should be considered in a clear and transparent way. Council therefore calls on the next Government to create an independent commission to ensure delivery of the devolved powers in as timely a manner as possible.

On the requisition of Councillor G Latty and J Procter, the voting on the amendments were recorded as follows;

Amendment in the name of Councillor Buckley

<u>YES - 15</u>

Anderson, Buckley, J L Carter, Castle, ,Cohen, Collins, Harrand, Lamb, G Latty, P Latty, J Procter, R Procter, Robinson, Wadsworth and Wood.

## <u>NO – 71</u>

Akhtar, J Bentley, S Bentley, A Blackburn, D Blackburn, Blake, Bruce, Campbell, Chapman Charlwood, Cleasby, Coulson, Coupar, Dawson, Dobson, Downes, Dunn, Finnigan, Gabriel, Golton, P Grahame, R Grahame, C Gruen, P Gruen, Groves, Hamilton, Hanley, Harington, Harland, Harper, A Hussain, G Hussain, G Hyde, Illingworth, Ingham, Iqbal, Jarosz, A Khan, Lay, Leadley, J Lewis, R Lewis, Lowe, Lyons, Macniven, Maqsood, J McKenna, S McKenna, Morgan, Mulherin, Nagle, Nash, Ogilvie, Pryor, Rafique, Renshaw, Ritchie, Selby, Smart, Sobel, E Taylor, Towler, Truswell, Urry, Varley, Venner, Walker, Walshaw, Wakefield, Wilkinson and Yeadon.

#### ABSTAIN - 0

Amendment in the name of Councillor Mulherin

# <u>YES - 72</u>

Akhtar, J Bentley, S Bentley, A Blackburn, D Blackburn, Blake, Bruce, Campbell, Chapman Charlwood, Cleasby, Coulson, Coupar, Cummins, Dawson, Dobson, Downes, Dunn, Finnigan, Gabriel, Golton, P Grahame, R Grahame, C Gruen, P Gruen, Groves, Hamilton, Hanley, Harington, Harland, Harper, A Hussain, G Hussain, G Hyde, Illingworth, Ingham, Iqbal, Jarosz, A Khan, Lay, Leadley, J Lewis, R Lewis, Lowe, Lyons, Macniven, Maqsood, J McKenna, S McKenna, Morgan, Mulherin, Nagle, Nash, Ogilvie, Pryor, Rafique, Renshaw, Ritchie, Selby, Smart, Sobel, E Taylor, Towler, Truswell, Urry, Varley, Venner, Walker, Walshaw, Wakefield, Wilkinson and Yeadon.

<u>NO – 15</u>

Anderson, Buckley, J L Carter, Castle, ,Cohen, Collins, Harrand, Lamb, G Latty, P Latty, J Procter, R Procter, Robinson, Wadsworth and Wood.

#### ABSTAIN - 0

# 118 Closing Remarks

Councillor J L Carter who was attending his last meeting of Council prior to his retirement as an Elected Member of Leeds City Council having served since 1972 briefly addressed the Council and thanked Members for their support over the last 43 years.

Council rose at 19.40